Meeting report GM on land issues 030507 (full version)

by Jonny on May 6, 2007, 6:54 pm

General Meeting on land issues

Thursday, 3rd May 2007 at SAWCHU

Called by: Auroville Council and LCC

Time: 5:00 pm to 7:00 pm

Chair: not identified

For AVC: Santo

Facilitators: Alan, Rolf

Notes (typing, real-time): Amy

Attendants: ~80

Alan: Welcome everybody once again. As there are far few people today, is it possible to get closer to each other?

A brief recap for those who were not at the previous two meetings: We had a meeting over a week ago when the LCC presented the situation as they see it and proposed a possible solution which is to exchange land from outside AV for land inside. They provided a list of possible lands to exchange. Last Monday we met to clarify the proposal and allow people to make presentations of their ideas. We ended up only clarifying the proposal. This meeting was closer to confrontation.

Today maybe there could be more collaboration. Most people feel that there is a land crisis. The disagreement is how to deal with it. I want to propose how to go about it now: we will start with the list of people who wanted to speak on Monday but could not. Paul and Jonny asked specifically to make a presentation. We'd like to begin with the presentations.

Maybe we can look for solutions out of the crisis, as far as possible collaborative solutions. Let us address the larger Auroville that we're all here for. Paul, we'll start with you.

Paul V.: I hope I won't be long. In the last two meetings there were statements that need correction. There was no room for introspection how to deal with this situation, about what went wrong. How did we get into such a situation?

Why can't we buy land? We complain about brokers. But we are the ones who inflated the cost of land. The last land purchase was in 2003. The cost per acre doubled in a very short time. This is one of the reasons why Mr. Sharma said stop, it's gone too far.

This is where I say introspection is needed. 300 acres of land, situated in the Green Belt, just at the southern hedge of the city, between Evergreen and Adventure, were offered to Auroville for a very low price. This was turned down and so badly handled by the LEM, that the owner was forced to look for other buyers. Then and only then the promoters came in. This is a matter of records. This guy previously helped us get land for the Matrimandir, he had met the Mother.

Many villagers do not want to deal with some members of the LCC. If other people were involved, we might be able to buy. Most LCC members don't come into the field to see what is happening, to look at encroachments. As a result, no protective measures to prevent these encroachments are initiated. The LCC does not challenge people who do wrong developments in the area reserved for the Master Plan of Auroville. The Swami's development in the Green Belt is the most striking example.

I propose a new Lands & Estate Management team to take care of Auroville lands, to develop them and to utilize fully all empty lands. This new group should be under supervision of the Development Group and answerable to the Residents Assembly. No member of this group should be involved in land purchase; those are two different functions.

Someone posted an advertisement about development of plots, using the GOI protected name of Auroville, why wasn't this brought to court? They have a layout-plan which shows the plots. This is supposed to be approved by the panchayat and the township ... this was never done. We have to stop these people. We have to have the will.

This is the work of the WC. The Secretary says we should move to go after these people. A mistake was done. We have to admit we started the fire in our house.

There are members in the LCC who will not be able to get the land ... the villagers aren't interested.

Alan: To recap what Paul has said, let's form a new group, separate from land purchase and second, go to court.

Jonny: Thank you AVC and LCC for giving us the opportunity to present different viewpoints. The LCC's strategy is focusing on consolidating the lands in the city area, urgently, by way of exchange. I do not categorically object to that but I do see quite a few buts and some question marks on vital issues.

I would invite you to look at our land a bit more closely. The AV lands are our physical body; the body of the community, as scattered as they are. This body has cells and tissues, it has nerves, I don't know where the backbone is, but it has organs. Some organs are well functioning, some less.

I got a bit alarmed when I first heard that 20 acres of afforested land in Annapurna are proposed for exchange. Now what about the forest? Our forests are the lungs of AV. In our forests the miracles are flowering, in our forests we can breathe the air of AV, more than anywhere else. Our forests are a trademark; the pioneers turned red soil into greenery. We are very much recognized for this work. We need to think more than 2 or 3 times, what we do with that.

We live now in a time when global warming is becoming a global consciousness and where the awareness of the role of trees in that is rising. What does AV stand for? What are we supposed to do here? We are called for a dream, for the future.

Now picture this scenario: we exchange forest land in Annapurna; what will happen, the bulldozers come in. What do we want this land for: to consolidate the city area. Then, when we have all the lands there: we call in the bulldozers! We can't talk about land without talking about planning and development of the city.

We had the dream to spread this forest all along the coast... has our dream become so small?! I would say strongly: no exchange of forest, any forest, even out in Hermitage, or Sadhana Forest ...everywhere where people are toiling and soiling with their hands because they believe in the land, because they work for a dream. I would keep all the forest land and even grow more.

Now, what about the farms? There is quite a bit of farm land on the list. For a growing population in AV, we need more food, we need more farms. Can these people exchange for better land, more land? We should increase the farm land. Where are those lands? I don't see them. I would be as careful with the farm land as with the forest. Most of this land is organically cultivated. We give them out of hand: pesticides or bulldozers move in. I would like us to save every acre from these two things around us.

A word on Eternity: I regard Eternity also as a land where people have toiled and soiled for decades to make the dream come true. Certain places stand for... certain ... whatever. That place has something to do with crisis and what we do with crisis. I remember the Tsunami. It was there where we came together to help... To offer that; to give that away... this is history of AV, and future. I want to share something: there are and sometimes they come very unexpected: yesterday I wanted to, tried to have a break, cool down ...to that purpose I read. Yesterday I had to stop after a few lines, on the following line: "Eternity sacrificed for a moment's bliss"... I thought, "Why do I have to read this now?" Maybe to share it here and to say no!

I said a lot of what I would not like to happen, now to what I would suggest. I would like us to consider Auromodel for exchange. I don't mean 1 acre, two or three plots... no, the whole compound! Including Petite Ferme and up to the Bommapalayam road. There are many good reasons: infrastructure, access, advantageous to the village. Kuilapalayam wants to develop. Whereto shall it develop? Now it is growing in our direction and there is unprotected land up to Surrender, up to Grace. If we don't protect this area it comes closer. If we exchange that for that ... Kuilapalayam can develop down there... they are happy and busy to develop towards the beach, we develop up here.

I would also consider the Pour Tous area, it has to be negotiated. Of course, a lot is happening there: Le Ferme, Maroma ...but why not? Only one thing: Aspiration I would not consider for exchange; Aspiration was the first AV community.

This would be my proposal. This instead of farm land, forest land ... Making Auromodel into a model for future development, into a model for securing the city lands and into a model for collaborative village development.

Alan: To recap Jonny, you propose forest and farm land should not be exchanged. Eternity should not. Exchange Auromodel and maybe Pour Tous area, but not Aspiration.

Jonny: Yes, and before we consolidate only the city area now we would need to know what is going to happen there... to make flat Aurodam for high-rise concrete buildings or to dig out a gigantic lake... let's not let that happen.

Paulette (without mike, not on the list): The Mother called 'Auromodel' a settlement of 2-3000 architects, engineers, workers and the staff necessary to build the town. Auromodel was meant to be an experiment in collective living and habitat, a prototype. Three phases were foreseen, in building the town: Aspiration, Auromodel, and finally the town proper. Henceforth it is out of question to dispose of Auromodel."

Alan: In fairness, I would like to go with the open forum people from last Monday. Not so much on history but what we need to do now. If we agree we're having a crisis...of course we can discuss presentations...but offer solutions too.

Yuval: The way I feel about it, it would be good if the LCC can come to us as a community and say we have a problem.

We should enlarge the LCC – people who are good with money; people with different qualities. We should also buy lands, let's see where we can get the money. I don't want to talk about exchange. They should talk to these people to get deeper to know what they put on the list. To keep it positive, I would focus on the people who own this 200 acres ... who are they, how much we offer, how much they want ... let's discuss it. As far as I know some people wanted to sell but for some reason it didn't go through. Let's not accuse people ... now we're dividing the community with lots of emotions and distrust. We're not talking about the right thing. To do a thing like this we need the whole community.

Alan: To recap Yuval, let's approach the people who have the 196 acres and see if they will sell and enlarge the LCC.

Jonah: To trade the land and buy a few acres in the city is going to solve the crisis? I don't think so. The issue is much larger. We have a lot of money....but we say we have none. How does that work? There is a contradiction there. AV is not about repeating what's happening in the world around. I am myself afraid when I see what's happening in the greenbelt. It's easy to react in fear and do this, this, this. Why are we afraid to spend the money? Why are we not using the money we have to buy land? There was an amount to buy land but the units didn't want to lend the money to buy the land. Where are we going? If like the rest of the world, then let's forget it. Somehow we're here for something different. Before, the villages gave us land. Where did we go wrong? Where did this big divide come from? If we work on the inner things that are going wrong, the physical things will work out consequently. If we try to fix only the outer, the inner will stay a mess.

On a personal note about Eternity: the tsunami wiped out everything... maybe in 10 years I would be ready to move out but now I am not. I feel betrayed by the community if I have to move. It's all I have left of my past. I don't give up but I surrender. It's not my problem -- it's our problem.

Alan: To recap Jonah, he questions about the money we have, how we use it or not, and our relation with the villagers? What happened? Now, Anita is next on the list but she's not here... Renu...

Renu: In the first meeting I had asked the LCC questions which I didn't get answers for. Some things continue to niggle: one question I asked is whether the LCC examined how the greenbelt bubble burst (*this is note-taker's paraphrase*). I do doubt their judgment...

On the thing of exchange: there may be some lands to exchange. But this list is not correct. Not to exchange land that has assets and life on it. There is land ... ask the stewards if they have land that could be exchanged. Every time we speak about selling land or exchanging it like the Tamarind trees, have we considered how this devalues the AV land and the activities taking place adjacent... will they move, are they valuable also? If we exchange the Tamarind trees... I see more Kashmiri shops and what about that around the bakery? Co-development might be interesting and lucrative to the villagers.

Is Forecomers on that map? It would be nice to look at the map... look at the land mass. How can we link, watersheds, forests? To buy land to link with what exists

today.

My other doubt on the judgment of the LEM ... I am so surprised that no one new the order (*providing some government protection*) had to be gazetted. Why did we only find out about that now? Our only protection is shelved? Why aren't we "barking up that tree?"... instead of asking Aurovilians to move ...

How can we develop land around the village, incentives to the villages? The Master Plan does not consider the 3 villages. Is this realistic? Let's adapt reality to fit the dream. There must be a link. There seems to be a veil keeping these from connecting. It's not good.

I am sure people want to buy land ... and want to have investment... we can relax some things ... all that exists because Mother was wide and free ... she didn't say do this or that... everything we're protecting now grew out of that freedom.

Some don't have disadvantage but create disadvantage for some of us. It's time to change. I put on the Intranet some of my ideas of what can be done. There's another thing. Well, Aurovilians working against the LCC; that's very sad and even sadder we're too frightened to speak about it. Bring that person here to talk about it. We're actually a dysfunctional family. Let's talk to each other. Let's say: "That's not cool.". All this under-the-rug-thing ... it only helps people to hurt Auroville.

Alan: Aurovilians should be able to buy land in the city.

Renu: We also need a land-use plan.

Alan: I don't want to go to a time restriction ... but we have 80 people ...

Anita: I don't know about the money... we have lots of businesses ... there has to be money. People know there is money. We say we want to fulfill Mother's dream. Without other people's money? Can't we go to a bank? We have collateral...assets...is that a possibility that has been looked into? Not just fund-raising, but taking loans.

Alan: To recap Anita ... mobilize the money in the community. Maybe also consider taking loans. Community takes the responsibility to repay loans.

Aryadeep: I will try to be specific. Land is an issue in which I have spent my 15 years of life in AV. I have one or two small observations. Basics: Mother says that behind AV is not a mental idea ... but an absolute. She knows AV will be. It may take 100 years, 1000 years ... ½!: she was very practical. More than once she said if people might not buy land quickly there will be complications. We are there. She was every step with us. We need to take care; listen to Her. All help will come. She said money will come. When people feel that it is great... when they feel like this, it will be no problem. Let us make a list of what AV has done, what AV is doing. Let's be clear. It will be great for Tamil Nadu... great for India. We should go to leaders and point this out ... what's good for Tamil Nadu... Maybe legal protection will happen. Let us prepare the potentiality of AV ... approach these people: collectors, MPs of Tamil Nadu, (I heard of an MP who is a friend of AV)... explain the potentiality ... then we get protection; no one can exploit the area. This information could go to businessmen of India; business leaders. We will get enough money; we will have enough projects; we will secure the future of AV.

Alan: To recap what Aryadeep said, working on what Mother said, people would want to give to AV. Make a list of AV potentials to share with people.

Paulette: I want to comment on what Jonah said and Paul too. We need serious introspection. The previous Secretary stopped all land purchase due to the Aurovilian brokers; heavy mistakes even from well-wishing Aurovilians (i.e. doubling the land prices); unclean transactions; secret purchases of land by Aurovilians in the city area, the greenbelt and outside the masterplan area, often through *benami* (fake names) contracts. The Auroville Foundation Act is the equivalent of nationalization; this makes *benami* doubly illegal. How can this happen, when the Aurovilians own nothing: as by the Act – as much as by Mother's guidelines?

On top, there are all sort of abuses vis-à-vis the villagers. We must present a clean face before claiming anything from the Central or Tamil Government – not to mention the villagers.

Alan (to Paulette): Can you please get to the point?

Paulette: My proposal is to look into the issues and clarify. If I was a villager, I wouldn't give anything to AV right now. There are abuses in every possible sense. These things have to stop. This has to come to the community. As long as this is happening we can not go to the officials.

Anna: I would also like to come back to things said on Monday. How about buying certain land outside AV and exchange that ... even do with people who have the land ... get the list from those who own the land, communicate with them. We don't want to exchange farms and forests. This seems clear. I have thought a lot about it... I would like to help. Such a job is a difficult job. All suggestions should be considered... go to the people... do investigations. Enlarge the group. A group of people to see into the problems, then go to the community and ask for help.

People get too involved; there is no reflection. If communication would have happened, things would have been clear. It's not clear how people really feel about this. Together we have to make a decision. We have to settle our internal way of functioning. It is essential that with all our opposites find unity. All that can exist, beside each other. Can AV buy land... ok guys you get this land... instead of exchange.

Paul V: I have missed some points: The 8 acres of Saravan's land, near the road. Some members of LCC want to buy it, some don't. The money there is there. To purchase this would cause a dent into the plot, this would be forcing the other 50 acres. This is prime land. We need to buy it and use it.

The land policy up to now had been to acquire lands along all access roads, entering through the Green Belt The LCC's policy now is to buy city's land. The LCC has not acquired any prime access land in the last one. This has not been approved by the community.

There are ways to tackle the situation. It requires those who are not scared ... it calls for people who believe in Mother's vision and are ready to implement it on the ground. People who realize that Auroville is in Tamil Nadu and our protection will come from

Chennai, not from Delhi. But this calls for drastic changes.

Santo: The reason we had these meetings was the LCC proposal ... to consolidate land in the city area. It's important we stick to the topic. Some day has to come... we have to say "yes" or "no". These things are all important but let's go back to that issue: do we decide (in July) to have an RA-meeting and say "yes" or "no" to the LCC proposal? Or do we go on talking in general? Anna, Yuval, Jonah were talking about exchange but others not really ...

Dhanapal: I have been at the three meetings ... we're always saying the 1,000 acres of the greenbelt area, don't sell there. 2 nd: to buy the land, what to do now. More than 50 acres in the city are ready for exchange. To buy that land would need an enormous amount. Where do we get this money from? Villagers say they don't want the money; the money disappears in the village. They are interested in land in certain areas ... people are asking us about these places. Today that is not happening. What to do with that? Suppose you want to buy 80 acres, plus some greenbelt near Edayanchavadi ... to buy 2 pieces of land... Where do we get this money? Someone is willing to exchange ... we need 30 acres. This guy wants land, not money!! If we don't buy the land, outside people will. Otherwise, the villagers will develop the land. What are we going to do? We need a solution. We have to prevent outside people from coming in and developing. We are in great difficulty today. We are fighting every day with villagers, with brokers. We have difficulty. The ball is in your court now. It's up to you. You need to find a solution.

Alan: Peter.

Peter CS: I will try to stay simple and focused. It is difficult. I could talk an hour to each person's comments. I would like to take you back to the beginning; to the here and now. They don't want to sell: don't know what to do with the money, can't spend it fast enough. It is a mistaken impression that we're moving lots of people; that there are lots of people associated with these lands. We have had a practice of exchange since '93, even earlier, in '89 - it's not new. What is new is that some of this land is being utilized. They are far away, we can consider changing them. If we had spent more time and would have added, then perhaps the temperature wouldn't have gone up. We have to look at the big picture. People are asking about roadside land. We have to look at that. If we can

identify that ... and get acres of land in the city, that would be fantastic.

Eternity, sorry. It's been an open question for 25 years. We have to put it on the table; we have to see where you stand. We're not going to impose anything on anyone. We're all together. Some are asking for Auroannam. We've worked things out in some places. We can propose, we aren't going to impose. This is real life. This is practical. This is what's going on. We can spend hours going over this... we're a team, but we don't pretend to be the dream team. Sometimes we score, sometimes we miss. There is another team, a team that works against us. We can't sit around in meetings, come up with ideas to do this and that. There is a world out there that doesn't go with our arrangements.

"Why don't we buy land far away and exchange that?" We have tried, it hasn't worked. Somehow the people haven't wanted. To drive 10 or 15 km away, it's not so easy. We don't know these people. We have to build up contacts, it is much more difficult than in the closer neighborhood.

Alan: There are more on the list who haven't been able to speak.

Kumar: I wouldn't want anyone to have to move against their will. The main road to Tindivanam will become a big highway in a few years. If villagers are asking for land we're not using, why not give it to them? If Anna and Yuval don't want to move, then ok. Some people may have land that they would consider... if there was a nice place on offer. Instead of us having big plots of land... we don't like people too close....if we offer something good then maybe. Felicity... along the road...worth some money... maybe not a bad idea to exchange it.

Alan: We have to have a sense of where we're going ...

Nikolai: Do we sacrifice the land to move forward? I want to talk about sacrificing the mind-set. We have this galaxy plan. It's overdue... let's involve all members of the community and not only an exclusive planning group. If we bring the plan up-to-date to address the environment of AV and India today, taking into consideration the real needs: water, etc. If we had a more ecological and sustainable plan we would get protection from outside organizations. They would be willing to help protect... we could have a set of

guidelines. We can not develop in a way that is detrimental to AV. That development needs to be done in a harmonious way. Something is blocked...and there is a reason. We need to reflect on the city plan and the mind-set that is creating these blocks in the first place.

Let's give equal priority to land in the greenbelt. After the summer break, let's hold visionary workshops, with Dreamcatchers, display their work which offers an alternative plan to AV. Let's redefine our mind-set and concentrate on consolidating the greenbelt. I believe then the money will come.

Jonah: I agree with you Peter, we can look at all possibilities. We should look at the big picture. Maybe... if we had approached in a different way... but the way it's been done, it's difficult to look at it. As much as the group represents, I don't trust it. I trust you individually but as a group... If this happens... what is going to happen in 10, 15 years on all levels? This needs to be looked at. We need to buy the land. There is a problem with money everywhere. I do not agree to sell land anywhere in AV. Maybe it's because of who I am. I don't like the idea. I believe if we sell, exchange, we will not solve the problem of land in AV. We need more than one solution. Maybe a different direction but I don't know which one.

Anna: I just want to explain a little what Jonah said. At meetings we shouldn't get so personal. The LCC don't know at all our stand. We are there the stewards of the land. It is a recognized coastal forest. It is an example of coastal management. I wouldn't mind to move but no one asked me "How do you really feel about it?" I have always been there, but I would love to experience the inside community of AV. I am not attached. But I can not see bulldozers developing the land. I want the dream but not in this way; I don't believe we find it that way.

Santo, you hurt me ... a couple times ...

(At this point Anna, Santo and Yuval get into a prolonged personal and emotional dispute, which is not recorded here)

Anna: After the tsunami ...

Alan: Ok. Let's do it privately. There are a lot of other people in the meeting. Let's have a minute of silence. Point taken!

Jayavel: First of all: the land service knows me well, I am famous... I bought some land in the greenbelt. There are so many reasons I bought it, it would take a lot of time to explain. I bought some land in the GB.

People are talking about 200 acres. We talk about money in the bank, but we have lots of assets in AV. We can go to the bank. Why can't AV do that? Is it a one man army, one guy playing this? If this guy goes out of the land service, all will go well. The money is there. The villagers are fed up with farming; my father knows; they're fed up. The villagers don't want to exchange the land, they want to sell it.

Alan: Where to go from here? One thing that strikes me is the number of statements re: selling, exchanging. There are many contradictory statements. How can we devise a policy if we're missing basic, factual information? I am looking for a way forward from this different opinions and ideas. Let's go out with a feeling of something we can do...

Ezhumalai: I wonder why we don't include the Secretary? He could help us. We should call him. He should be here with us face to face.

Carel: You (Alan) asked for a proposal. How to proceed? The LCC has proposed its strategy and in these three meetings others have proposed also. I would like to hear from the LCC what they say about what has been proposed by others. Unless there is a final proposal, we can't decide. What do you think of what has been proposed? We have one more GM to discuss... then an RA to decide.

Monique: I am shocked by what Jayavel has said, it reverses much of the info we have received. I am puzzled. There is complete different information. This is

important. Someone of LCC can explain?

Then, more importantly: we have money since a long time... I have given myself, as much as I can for the land. I am not a millionaire; I am sometimes making money....for years I have given everything I could for the land but recently because the money isn't being used except to feed the Central Fund, I was hesitant to give. I start to be hesitant to give. Mother said, "Money belongs to those who spend it". Can we buy something with the money we have? Can we do it or is it impossible? In the greenbelt or in the city? Let's spend this money, then we can get more. I know it was blocked, Ok, but now... Maybe I missed something...: the LCC said it doesn't want to be broke? Maroma can be broke, but the LCC...?

Alan: Can someone from the LCC reply to this question?

Monique: Don't forget my first thing ...

Francois G: I support the motion that Carel put on the floor, that the LCC put together what came from this 3 meetings. We meet maybe next Monday... then we see where the community stands ... I would like to know where the community stands. If we could meet on Monday with a renewed or reconsidered proposal on the part of the LCC then we take it from there.

Alan: Is that a feasible time scale?

Peter CS: Yes.

Alan: We're asking LCC to take into consideration all our ideas, and come back to the group with a modified or same proposal.

Carel: I am stunned the LCC can do this so quickly. Maybe they need feedback from FAMC ... Yuval: Sounds amateurish to me. Dhanapal, you're on the LCC ... Alan: Dhanapal: FAMC... dealing with Unity Fund ... we need 3 to 4 weeks. A month to get everything... We're facing an urgent situation. Alan: Carel: Not this Monday, but following Monday? I want to see these answers in writing. Peter CS: I understood Carel's question: can we re-propose based on community feedback: then yes we can. But to talk about getting crores, then we need more time of course! Banks, more questions ... takes more time. Alan: We can't talk about what the community wants or not... we need more There aren't enough people here tonight. We're trying to collaborate to come

up with the best solution. Can we say the LCC ... say they can come next Monday, processed what's come across and present it to us on Monday? We can turn up and

see. It's the least we can do in terms of respect.

Raman: We're talking about consolidation of land, then emotion came, and today more... then we add, subtract, multiply and come back on Monday. We can't do this.

We need another working meeting and include the people from the house and increase that capacity. This is not a conclusion, only a proposal. It needs time. Not by Monday. In reality the LCC has not 12 active members. (*someone asks Raman from which position he is speaking*) I am speaking as a member of the LCC.

Alan: Do I understand you correctly: expand the working group temporarily? Make it a larger group to come up with a proposal? Can we ask the LCC members here? (*no objections*)

Those who have expressed themselves strongly: could you meet with them separate?

Say 12 to 15 people work together, make the time, then come back to a larger meeting. No meeting with the community on Monday. We wait for that meeting ...

Raman: There is a meeting already scheduled between the AVC and the LCC for next Wednesday. It could happen there.

Renu: Who will announce the meeting?

Raman: The Council.

Renu: One last thing: I just want to say that I very much appreciate Jayavel coming forward, saying that he was sort of the "bad guy"... but he had the guts to come forward. Thank you!

The meeting ends with a few moments of silence

Posted in <u>Discussion</u>

by Monique P on May 7, 2007, 7:33 am

About what was said by Jayavel:

Jayavel clearly said: "The villagers don't want to exchange the land, they want to sell the land."

About what I said: I didn't refer to what Dhanapal has said but to what Jayavel has said and more precisely to the above sentence which is missing in the report.

Thank you for the correction. Monique

by Jonny on May 7, 2007, 11:59 am

thank you monique. done.

Source URL: https://auroville.org.in/article/6134